

17-*ell*

4474.c

T H E

F R E Q U E N C Y

O F

CAPITAL PUNISHMENTS

INCONSISTENT WITH

JUSTICE, SOUND POLICY, AND RELIGION.

Being the Substance of a

S E R M O N.

K
By **WILLIAM DODD, LL.D.**
CHAPLAIN TO THE KING.

Printed for W. FADEN, in Peterborough-Court,
Fleet-Street; B. LAW, in Ave-Maria-Lane; and
E. and C. DILLY, in the Poultry Price 6d.

[1762]



ADVERTISEMENT.

THE following Sermon was intended to have been preached in the Chapel Royal at St. James's, but omitted on account of the absence of the Court during the author's month of waiting. It is now humbly offered to the consideration of the serious and humane; those more especially, of the great council of the nation: and if any thing in it shall be judged worthy regard, and shall serve to awaken attention to the important object in view, the writer will think his pains sufficiently repaid, and his little effort amply rewarded.

*The following WORKS, by the Rev. Dr. DODD,
may be had of W. FADEN, &c.*

1. **P**Ractical Discourses on the Miracles and Parables of our Blessed Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ. A new Edition, in four Vols. Octavo. Price bound 1l. 4s.
2. Sermons "on the Duties of the Great," translated from the French of M. Massillon, Bishop of Clermont, preached before Louis the XVth. during his Minority. Dedicated by Permission to the Prince of Wales. 4s. sewed.
3. Sermons to Young Men. To each Sermon are subjoined Anecdotes tending to enforce and illustrate the Subject. 3 Vols. 10s. 6d. bound.
4. Comfort for the Afflicted under every Distress, with suitable Devotions. Price 5s. bound.
5. An Account of the Rise, Progress, and Present State of the Magdalen Hospital, with the Sermons before the President, &c. Together with the Psalms, Hymns, Prayers, and Rules of that Hospital. Price 3s. 6d. bound.
6. Reflections on Death. Price 2s. 6d. bound.
7. Contemplations on the History of the New Testament, by the Right Reverend Joseph Hall, D. D. and Bishop of Norwich. Together with his Life and Hard Measure, written by himself. The whole carefully revised, the obsolete Words and Expressions explained, and the Texts of sacred Scripture added. By the Rev. W. Dodd, LL. D. In two Pocket Vols. 6s. bound.
8. Visitor. 2 Vols. 6s. bound.
9. Poems on several Subjects. 8vo. 4s.
10. — On the Glorious Epiphany. 1s. 6d.
11. — Epistle to a Lady. 1s.

Also the following single Sermons and Tracts.

1. The sinful Christian condemned by his own Prayers. The fourth Edition, Price 6d.
2. Popery inconsistent with the natural Rights of Men in general, and of Englishmen in particular, Price 6d.
3. Mutual Knowledge in a future State, offered as an Argument of Consolation under the Loss of Friends. 2d Edit. 6d.
4. Cautions against Methodism; or Unity recommended, a Discourse before the religious Societies of London. 2d Edit. 6d.
5. Three Sermons on the Wisdom and Goodness of God in the Vegetable Creation, preached before the Apothecaries Company in the Years 1759, 1760, 1761. 2d Edit. 1s. each.
6. The Sabbath Day well spent. 3d. or 2s. 6d. a Dozen.
7. An Earnest Address to his Parishioners, by a Minister of the Church of England, concerning the Necessity, Nature, Means, and Marks of true Faith in Jesus Christ, designed principally for the Poor. 6th Edit. Price 2d, or 1s. 6d. a Dozen.

EXODUS XX. 13.

THOU SHALT NOT KILL.

HOWEVER fashionable it may be, amongst a certain order of men, to condemn the Religion, and decry the Laws of *Moses*; there is one proof of their excellence, which it is not very easy to invalidate: "An imitation of them is plainly "to be traced in the most ancient institutions." Nor can we doubt a moment that the wisest and greatest legislators of antiquity drew from this source, and formed their laws upon this great model. Indeed, the truth of this assertion has been put out of all question by the learned labours of some, employed in an accurate detail of it*: Nor is it at all to be wondered that those laws should have been generally copied and imitated, when we consider, that they owe their original to the Divine Wisdom, and are well worthy that wisdom from whence they spring.

'Tis true, great part of those laws was calculated for a particular people, and to answer particular ends; and in this respect they are admirably formed.

* See Petit. *Leges Atticæ*, and *Critici Sacri*. part II. Vol. I. Also *Pithoei Mosaicarum & Romanarum Legum Collatio*.

B

But

7

But the *moral laws*—to which we more immediately refer,---are, it must be allowed, accommodated in the best manner possible to the welfare of society, and to the grand ends of securing the life, the property, the reputation, and the peace of mankind. The Decalogue alone contains the basis of all moral equity; nor is it easy to conceive more instructive and important wisdom, couched in a compass so comprehensive and intelligible. Hence (by the way) we may remark one instance, amongst a thousand, of the utility of the *Christian Sabbath*; which, holding up constantly the ten great laws delivered by God himself, in the most solemn manner, serves deeply to impress the minds even of the most ignorant; and tends, no doubt, greatly to keep alive that conscientious dread of atrocious offences, by which the jarring elements of society are preserved in such decent and tolerable order.

How far the *Jews*, or how far many even amongst christians, entered into the spirit of the Mosaic laws, it is not easy to determine. We learn however, from our Divine Legislator, who came to *fulfil*, to complete and perfect, and to shew those laws in their utmost and *spiritual* extent, That *we* are called to higher privileges, and of consequence to higher perfection; that *we*, as his disciples, are by no means to rest in the *letter*, but to consider those laws as directed to the *heart*; to the very spring and source of the evil which they mean to correct. Thus, for instance, with respect to that law which I have chosen for my text, He tells us,*

“ That *we*, as christians shall much mistake its
 “ force, and fall short of its completion, if we con-
 “ ceive it, with *some of old time*, calculated merely

* See Matt. c. v. ver. 17, 21, &c.

“ to prevent *actual murder*, and the immediate effu-
 “ sion of blood. Directed to the inmost intention,
 “ its great purpose and design is to correct every
 “ Tendency to so capital an evil, and to prevent
 “ even the Probability of an offence so notorious,
 “ by teaching us to restrain the first sallies of wrath,
 “ and to bury in eternal oblivion every cause of
 “ resentment.”

The depth of the Divine Wisdom in thus *laying the ax to the root of the tree*, must be manifest to the least reflection; and every man who thinks at all, must be well assured, that this regard to first principles, this purification and rectitude of the *intention*, is the alone solid and certain barrier against vice; is the only sure and substantial basis of virtue.

Murder is a crime of such a sort, that human nature, in its genuine operations, shrinks with horror from it. Nor is it to be supposed even possible, were our Saviour's injunction respecting *wrath and resentment* in any degree regarded. But, *these* let loose, man becomes a wild ungovernable creature; and while their tyranny prevails over the soul, there is no wonder that crimes even horrible as *murder* ensue. We may therefore easily discern from hence how much it is our duty—if we would avoid the dreadful Probability of falling into the *worst crimes*,--to guard with the strictest caution against *those*, which, in another view, we may consider as the *least*; but which, as seen in their consequences, are truly *formidable*.

We might instance in many particulars: but, while guarded by rank and education from any apprehension of voluntary murder—Is there not a species of murder, savage in its nature, irrational in its

mode, and un-christian in its whole proceeding, from the danger of which the highest ranks are by no means exempt, and which yet, for the most part, owes its origin to furious *anger and resentment*?— Were *these* checked in their rise, were men cautious to purify their intention, and to curb the first fallies of passion, the Gothick practice of *Duelling* would soon be exploded; nor would any unfortunate *murderer* have occasion to deplore in future life, his hands stained perhaps with the blood of his dearest friend, destroyed by his precipitate wrath!*

There is also another kind of *murder*, which (tho' some of the heathen world have endeavoured in a measure to *applaud*; and some of modern times have attempted to *palliate*, if they could not defend) is yet no less positively forbidden by the law before us, "THOU SHALT NOT KILL," than it would be completely prevented by an attention to our Saviour's explanation of that law. Pride and resentment commonly give arms to the desperate resolution of the gloomy *Suicide*; who, too haughty to support injuries, and too resentful to forgive, or implore forgiveness, flies with horrible guilt into future, irremediable evils, from those, which a small degree of patience and humility would render not only tolerable here, but perhaps rewardable eternally.

Thus we see that this commandment of Moses particularly as explained and spiritualized by *Jesus Christ*, if duly regarded, would admirably and completely serve the great purpose designed, and prove in every view an ample barrier and fence of the human life: that *life*, which God hath been pleased from the beginning to hold and to treat as so sacred

* See a Discourse on this subject in the third vol. of Sermons to Young Men, p. I, &c.

that the voluntary destruction of it should admit of no pardon; *Whoso sheddeth man's blood, runs the sacred charter, by man shall his blood be shed*: And the important reason is immediately subjoined; *for in the image of God made be man*. Hence it is that in all governments, and under all laws, the most lenient, as well as the most severe, *Murder* has never escaped condemnation; nor has any legislator thought himself justified in exacting less than blood for blood; in perfect agreement with that decision of Moses “*That the land cannot be cleansed of the blood that is shed in it, but by the blood of him that shed it.*”*

But while reason and religion, while every law human and divine, concur in the justice of this sentence, and allow life for life; may it not be fairly questioned, whether any legislator or magistrate, any state or society, can with *Justice* take away life for every offence, and in many cases for *trivial* offences?—There are, no doubt, some crimes so atrocious in their nature, so immediately injurious to society, that they must and ought to be *capitally punished*. But, allowing this, the question still recurs, and seems not easy to be resolved: nor can those laws well be justified, which, in a variety of instances, exact the extremest penalty for offences by no means extreme in their nature.

To those who are acquainted with the nature of our constitution, the mildness of our government, the temper of our people, and particularly the humane and benevolent spirit which characterizes the present times; to such, it may well seem *strange*, if not wholly *incredible*, that the evil just referred to should be found amongst us, and that of all

* Numb. xxxv. 33.

nations upon earth, the laws of England perhaps should be the most sanguinary: there being in them, as I am credibly informed, above *one hundred and fifty capital cases**; and, in full proof thereof, almost continual executions!

Were any valuable ends of government, any principles of sound POLICY, any purposes of public reformation answered by this proceeding, it might

* Dr. Blackstone in his *Commentaries*, after speaking of the gradation of punishment assigned in the laws of England, and of the hope of transportation thereby given, observes, "Yet tho' in this instance we may glory in the wisdom of the English laws, we shall find it more difficult to justify the frequency of capital punishment to be found therein inflicted (perhaps inattentively) by a multitude of successive, independant statutes, upon crimes very different in their natures. It is a melancholy truth, that among the variety of actions which men are daily liable to commit, no less than 160 have been declared by acts of parliament * to be felonies without benefit of clergy, or, in other words, to be worthy of instant death. So dreadful a list, instead of diminishing, increases the number of offenders. The injured, through compassion, will often forbear to prosecute: Juries, through compassion, will sometimes forget their oaths, and either acquit the guilty, or mitigate the nature of the offence: And Judges, through compassion, will respite one half of the convicts, and recommend them to the royal mercy. Among so many chances of escaping, the needy and hardened offender overlooks the multitude that suffer; he boldly engages in some desperate attempt to relieve his wants, or supply his vices; and if unexpectedly the hand of justice overtakes him, he deems himself peculiarly unfortunate in falling at last a sacrifice to those laws, which long impunity has taught him to contemn."

* See Ruff head's index to the statutes, Tit. Felony: and the acts which have been since made.

certainly

certainly be the better justified. But so far is this from being the case, that sound POLICY, no less than RELIGION and HUMANITY, reverts against the practice.

In a nation like ours, crowded with business, and extensive in dominion, the *life* of the *subject*, of the *common people* especially, (those nerves and sinews of a state) is peculiarly valuable: and consequently, every method to promote and increase *population* must be desirable and important. But what can be more contrary to this end than the cutting off continually, numbers of these subjects, and that, for the most part, at a very early period of life, when the ends of government might be better answered by *saving* them, and those lives be rendered useful to the community?

For, it is evident to the slightest observation, that the only ends at which government can be supposed to *aim*, in the execution of *criminals*, are not answered by the frequency of our executions. *Correction* and *example* are the only proper objects of punishment. It is plain that the *former* can never be attained by the *death* of the sufferer; and for the *latter*, we are every day fully assured, that public executions are not of the least avail. The common people flock to them, as to a spectacle, in which they are gratified! and we constantly hear of crimes, not less flagitious than those for which the criminal is to die, perpetrated even at the very place and moment of his punishment.

And, if neither *example* nor *reformation* is effected by the *death* of these offenders; if the state is in no respect benefited, but on the contrary injured, by the diminution of its members; If all
the

the good ends of punishment may be attained; and better attained, by subjecting such offenders to perpetual *servitude* and labour; does not the voice of humanity, of christian charity and benevolence, unite with that of sound Policy, to implore from the throne of princes this salutary amendment of the laws?

An able and illustrious foreigner, whose work breathes the true spirit of humanity and freedom, hath urged a variety of arguments on the Topick, well known, I persuade myself, to this audience, and therefore the less necessary to be insisted on at present. He seems to have proved beyond dispute what I have suggested before, "That the punishment of death can never be *just*, in cases of that nature to which we refer." Nor are his arguments less conclusive, to shew the superior advantages arising from condemning offenders to *servitude* and labour. "It is not the *intensity* of the pain (he has justly remarked) which has the greatest effect on the mind, but its *continuance*: For our sensibility is more easily and more powerfully affected by *weak* but *repeated* impressions, than by a violent but *momentary* impulse. The death of a criminal is a terrible but momentary impulse, and therefore a less efficacious method of deterring others, than the *continual* example of a man deprived of his liberty, and condemned as a beast of burden to repair by his labors the injury he has done to society. "If I commit such a crime" (says the spectator to himself) I shall be reduced to that miserable condition for the rest of my life!" A much more powerful preventive than the

the fear of death, which men always behold in distant obscurity. “ The *execution* of a criminal is to the multitude a spectacle, which in some excites *compassion* mixed with indignation : these sentiments occupy the mind much more than that salutary *terror* which the laws endeavour to inspire : But in the contemplation of *continued* suffering, *terror* is the only, or at least the predominant sensation.”*

It would be easy, if a complete discussion of this subject was intended, to shew at large the *injustice* of those laws which demand *blood* for the slightest offences ; the superior *justice*, and the *propriety* of inflicting perpetual and laborious Servitude ; the greater utility hereof to the sufferer, as well as to the state, and to *our* state especially ; wherein we have a variety of necessary occupations peculiarly noxious and prejudicial to the lives of the honest and industrious, and in which *they* might be employed, who had forfeited their lives and their liberties to society. It would likewise be easy to remove those *objections*, which some, from motives of *policy*, and others of *humanity*, have urged against perpetual *slavery*, in a land of freedom like ours : and it would be easy to urge examples both in ancient and modern states, sufficiently strong to excite imitation. But, meaning only to plead a little in the cause of justice and humanity (neither unbecoming, let me hope, the sacred Character which I bear, the solemn Place in which I speak, nor the august Audience before whom I plead ; ever quick,

* See the Marquis de Beccaria's Essay on crimes and punishments, and “ the principles of Penal Law.” Edit. 2. A work, which I am pleased to add to the former, as no less honourable to humanity, to its author, and the present age.

I am

I am persuaded, to listen to that *cause*) I have not attempted to dilate the subject, but have thrown out general hints and observations only for future deliberation. And happy shall I think my poor and humble endeavours, if they shall tend to raise a single compassionate thought in any superior breast, on a subject which surely well merits the most serious discussion.

If amongst the Romans a *Civick crown* was the reward of him who saved the life of a single *citizen*; of what may not *they* be thought worthy, who, by forwarding so salutary and important a reformation as we have suggested, shall be instrumental to save from an ignominious death, *numbers* of subjects and citizens; hurried into eternity in the very bloom and flower of life; with all their sins and imperfections on their heads; and cut off at once from all power of reformation, from all possibility of making amends to the *state* they have injured, to the *friends* they have distressed, and the *God* they have daringly offended?

It would scarce be credited, if related in distant climes, that a *Barbarism* like this remained in a christian country, celebrated throughout the earth for its justice, its humanity, its benevolence! It can scarce be doubted, that from such a country a barbarism like this will speedily be banished; and the less doubted, when we reflect,—with triumph reflect, on those great and illustrious proofs which have already been given of the high love of justice and the generous regard to it, which actuates the ruling powers; Proofs sufficient to immortalize any reign, and make it dear and venerable to the latest posterity.

posterity.* May they be truly felt and gratefully acknowledged; and thus become the noble incentives to a perseverance in actions no less honourable to government than beneficial to the people! Incentives, in particular, to add that further proof of an attachment to *Justice*, which these feeble efforts have attempted to recommend; and which could not fail to secure universal affection. For, to conclude in the words of the illustrious *Italian* before mentioned—"If these truths should
 "haply force their way to the thrones of
 "princes, Be it known to them, that they come
 "attended with the secret wishes of all mankind:
 "And tell the sovereign, who deigns them a gracious reception, that *his* fame shall out-shine the
 "glory of conquerors; and that equitable posterity
 "will exalt *his* peaceful trophies above those of a
 "*Titus*, an *Antoninus*, or a *Trajan*.

"How happy were mankind, if laws were now
 "to be first formed! now that we see on the
 "thrones of Europe benevolent monarchs, friends
 "to the virtues of peace, to the arts and sciences;
 "fathers of their people! tho' crowned, yet citizens! The increase of whose authority augments
 "the happiness of their subjects, by destroying
 "that intermediate despotism which intercepts
 "the prayers of the people to the throne! If these
 "humane princes have suffered the old laws to
 "subsist, it is, doubtless, because they are deterred

* The truth of this assertion is evident. The facts more especially referred to, are his Majesty's making the judges independent, and the houses of parliament limiting their privileges with respect to domesticks, &c.

" by

“ by the numberless obstacles which oppose the
 “ subversion of *errors* established by the sanction
 “ of ages ;—and therefore every wise citizen will
 “ wish for the increase of their authority :”

Which God Almighty grant to all such just
 and virtuous princes, for the greater exertion of
 good ; for the increase of their people’s happiness ;
 and for the fuller, the universal establishment of
 righteousness and equity, of christian truth, be-
 nevolence and peace, throughout all the earth, &c!

Amen.

☞ The Author has here subjoined some extracts
 translated from the EMPRESS of RUSSIA’s cele-
 brated *Code of Laws*, as it cannot fail to be agree-
 able to the Reader to know the sentiments of so
 great and able a Legislator on the subject of this
 Discourse: and indeed it is highly pleasing to observe
 not only the justice, but the humanity, which runs
 through this admirable Code.

*Extracts from the Empress of Russia's Code
of Laws.*

C H A P. VIII. ART. 94.

IT were unjust to inflict the same punishment upon the highway-robber, as upon him who both robs and assassinate. For the publick security, therefore, it is evidently necessary to make some difference in the punishment prescribed for these several crimes.

ART. 95. There is a Country, where thieves do not commit murder: the reason is, because while thieves are there left to hope for transportation to the Colonies, murderers are excluded from that hope.

ART. 96. Good laws adopt the just medium. They do not in all cases impose pecuniary mulcts, nor do they in all cases inflict corporal punishments. All punishments whatever, that mutilate or disfigure the human frame, ought to be abolished.

C H A P. X. QUEST. 5.

How to proportion punishments to the greatness of crimes.

ART. 205. The end proposed in the institution of punishments, cannot be to torment a being whom God has endued with feelings. The object of punishments is to prevent the guilty in future from doing injury to society, and to deter their fellow-
C citizens

citizens and countrymen from committing the like offences : and such punishments, accordingly, ought to be applied, as, being proportioned to the crimes, may make the most lively and durable impression upon men's minds, at the same time that they are attended with the least appearance of cruelty to the body of the criminal.

ART. 206. Who does not tremble with horror at seeing in history so many barbarous and useless tortures, invented and employed in cool blood, by men who call themselves Sages ? Who does not feel his inmost soul agonized at the sight of those thousands of unfortunate wretches who have suffered, and are daily suffering them ; accused of crimes often improbable (not to say impossible) ; often merely suggested by ignorance, and sometimes by superstition ? Who is there, I say, that can steadfastly and unpitying, behold men, racked and torn to pieces by men, their brethren, and that too with horrid pomp and parade ? Those countries, and those times in which the most cruel punishments were inflicted, are those in which we have seen the most atrocious enormities perpetrated in the most daring manner.

ART. 207. For a punishment to produce the desired effect, it is enough that the evil which it occasions exceed the fancied advantage resulting from the crime ; at the same time taking into the account of such evil, preponderating the good, the Certainty of the punishment, and the loss of those advantages which the crime might be supposed to produce. All such severity as exceeds these limits, is useless, and consequently tyrannical.

ART.

QUEST. 6. ART. 209. Whether punishment by Death is of utility, and necessary for the security and good order of a state ?

ART. 210. Experience demonstrates, that the frequent repetition of capital punishments hath never yet made men better. If therefore I can shew that *in the ordinary state of Society*, the death of a citizen is neither useful nor necessary, I shall have pleaded the cause of humanity with success. I said, "*in the ordinary State ;*" for the death of a citizen may be necessary, in one particular case ; I mean when, though deprived of Liberty, he hath still means and power left to disturb the national repose ; a case which can never happen, except when a people loses or recovers it's liberty, or in times of Anarchy, when disorder and confusion usurp the place of laws. But while those laws bear quiet and peaceful sway, and under a form of government approved by the united voice of the nation ; in a State defended against enemies from without, sustained by the firm basis of power and general sanction from within, and where authority is lodged in the hands of the Sovereign : In such a state there can be no necessity for taking away the life of a citizen. The twenty years reign of the Empress ELIZABETH gave the fathers of the people a more excellent pattern, than that of all the pomps of war, victory, and devastation, held forth by the most glorious conquerors.

ART. 226. If two crimes, unequally hurtful to Society, receive an equal punishment, this unequal distribution of penalty will produce that strange contradiction, little attended to, though very frequently

quently obvious ; “ That the laws will have occasion to punish crimes, which they themselves have countenanced.”

ART. 227. If the same punishment be assigned for him who kills a brute animal, as for him who kills a man, or forges a writing of great importance, there will soon be no difference or distinction made between these crimes, by careless and profligate men.

2 AU 58

Art. 228. If two citizens, unequally situated to society, receive an equal punishment, this unequal distribution of penalty will produce that strange contradiction, little attended to, though very frequently

m

Mrs. Keppel
from James Minto
Port Bannatyne
6 September 1822